

Burning Billions: Record public money for fossil fuels impeding climate action

Methodology note and reference list

By Tara Laan, Anna Geddes, and Nhat Do

Acknowledgements

The briefing, *Burning Billions: Record Public Money for Fossil Fuels Impeding Climate Action*, was written by Tara Laan, Anna Geddes, Nhat Do, Laura Cameron, Sidharth Goel, and Natalie Jones.

The authors wish to thank the following individuals and institutions for the valuable comments and recommendations that they provided as reviewers:

- Aia Brnic, Chris Beaton, Deepak Sharma, Ivetta Gerasimchuk, Jonas Kuehl, Lukas Welker, Olivier Bois von Kursk, Siddharth Goel, and Shruti Sharma (International Institute for Sustainable Development)
- Claire O'Manique (Oil Change International)
- Diala Hawila and Faran Rana (International Renewable Energy Agency)
- Nate Vernon (International Monetary Fund)
- Ronald Steenblik (Senior Technical Advisor to the Quaker United Nations Office).

We would also like to thank the governments of Denmark, Norway, and Sweden for their generous support of this publication. The opinions expressed and the arguments employed in this update do not necessarily reflect those of peer reviewers and funders, nor should they be attributed to them.

Purpose

This methodology note and reference list accompanies the briefing *Burning Billions: Record Public Money for Fossil Fuels Impeding Climate Action*. The briefing brings together the most recent data (at the time of writing) on

- government financial support to fossil fuel production and consumption between 2013 and 2022, namely
 - subsidies
 - o capital investment by fossil fuel state-owned enterprises (SOEs)
 - o international public finance
- externalities associated with the burning of fossil fuels
- government financial commitments for renewable power generation
- investment (public and private) in fossil fuels and renewable energy.

The purpose of the methodology note is to provide information on the definition of government support, sources and data used, overarching assumptions, and data gaps.

The digital story follows a briefing released in August by the International Institute for Sustainable Development (IISD) and partners looking at public support for fossil fuels provided by the G20 countries (Laan et al., 2023). Both briefings build on a 2020 publication by IISD and partners, *Doubling Back and Doubling Down: G20 Scorecard on Fossil Fuel Funding* (Geddes et al., 2020a), and use the same methods for estimating fossil fuel support (except for the 2022 fossil fuel subsidy data). Please see the 2020 *Methodology Note* for details (Geddes et al. 2020b).

The current methodology note provides sources for all data and any estimation methods that differ from the G20 scorecard, namely 2022 fossil fuel subsidies and renewable energy support and investment.

Types of Government Support

Governments support energy production and consumption through different types of public financial flows, concessional tax rates, and foregone revenue, as well as through policies that have an impact on the sector but are difficult to quantify financially (e.g., environmental regulation exemptions).

In the briefing, we aim to bring together data on several key types of government policies that provide financial support to fossil fuels and renewable power. We define and track "government support" as follows (see Table 1 for more details):

- subsidies (e.g., direct budget transfers, tax expenditures, and consumer price support [induced transfers] through regulated below-market prices for consumers);
- public finance (e.g., loans and guarantees) at both market and below-market value;
 and
- SOE investment (capital expenditure [capex]) at both market and below-market values.

Sources and Methodology

Table 1 provides an overview of the support measures and data sources used in the briefing, which are described in more detail in the following sections.

Table 1. Overview of support measures and data sources covered in the briefing

Data type	Period	Beneficiary	Method, source, and date collected
Fossil fuels	•		
Subsidies	2017–2021	Producers and consumers of fossil fuels	2017–2021: Fossil Fuel Subsidy Tracker (FFST) (FossilFuelSubsidyTracker.org, n.da, n.dc)
			Data obtained May 16, 2023
	2022	Producers and consumers of fossil fuels	IMF Fossil Fuel Subsidies Data: 2023 Update (Black et al., 2023)
International public finance	2013 - 2022	Producers of fossil fuels and clean energy, including power	Public Finance for Energy Database (n.d.), G7 and MDBs only Data obtained September 2023
SOE investment	2017– 2019	Producers of fossil fuels, including power	Doubling Back and Doubling Down: G20 Scorecard on Fossil Fuel Funding (Geddes et al., 2020a)
	2020–2022	Producers of fossil fuels, including power	Capex data collected by IISD from company annual reports and government reports Data obtained from April to October 2023
Renewable energy	1		1
Subsidy commitments	2020–June 2023	Producers and consumers	Energy Policy Tracker (n.d.), Government Energy Spending Tracker (International Energy Agency [IEA], 2023e); Internet searches (data provided on request) Data obtained September 2023
Investment		Private and public	Global Landscape of Renewable Energy Finance 2023 (Climate Policy Initiative & International Renewable Energy Agency [IRENA], 2023)
Taxation			•
Externalities	2021	Producers and consumers	IMF Fossil Fuel Subsidies Data: 2023 Update (Black et al., 2023)
Source: Authors	' description	•	

Fossil Fuel Subsidies (2013–2021)

The source of information for subsidies for all countries for the years 2013 to 2021 was the <u>FFST</u>, a data aggregator that draws together the latest subsidy data from the IEA (n.d.-a), International Monetary Fund (IMF, 2022), and Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) (n.d.). See the Overarching Data and Assumptions section below for details on data conversions from nominal to real.

Fossil Fuel Subsidies (2022)

At the time of writing, the OECD had not yet released its estimates for 2022, therefore, we could not use consolidated data from the FFST. Instead, we use the IMF's estimates of "explicit" subsidies as the most recent global estimate.

In October 2023, the IEA (n.d.-b) estimated that global consumption subsidies for fossil fuels were USD 1.1 trillion in 2022, covering 47 countries, including a mix of advanced, emerging, and developing economies. The IEA estimates are based on a "price gap" measurement, which estimates the difference between international market benchmarks for each fuel and the corresponding domestic prices in each country.

In August 2023, the IMF issued a global estimate of what it categorizes as "subsidies" for fossil fuels, totalling USD 7 trillion in 2022 (Black et al., 2023). This estimate covered 170 countries and includes what the IMF calls "explicit" and "implicit" subsidies. Their estimate of explicit subsidies largely comprises consumer price support, but also includes some fiscal incentives commonly understood as subsidies. The IMF's estimates of explicit subsidies—using the price gap approach and a projection of some producer subsidies (based on OECD data)—are provided in this briefing, given that theirs is a global estimate (USD 1.3 trillion in 2022). The IMF's explicit subsidies and the IEA's consumer price gap subsidies are closely aligned. We use the IMF's because the country coverage is greater, and it includes an estimate of producer subsidies.

What the IMF calls "implicit subsidies" are more commonly known as externalities or social costs. Social costs include the failure to fully charge for environmental damages, such as from air pollution and climate change, traffic-related costs² including accidents, congestion, and road damage, as well as exempting fuels and electricity (including the externality component) from general consumption taxes. We provide the IMF's estimates of external costs in our section on taxes and social costs, but we do not classify them as subsidies.

In 2022, subsidies were also provided to fossil fuels that were priced above international benchmark market prices in the form of tax cuts and transfers to reduce energy costs, such as heating, electricity, and transport fuels. The majority of these subsidies would not be captured by the IMF's price gap measures. At the time of writing, no global source was available that reconciled consumer price gap estimates with energy crisis-related

¹ The methodology and definitions of the FFST apply to this work and can be found on its website: https://fossilfuelsubsidytracker.org/about/.

² We note that the IMF's inclusion of traffic-related costs is controversial. See the section on externalities for a short discussion.

affordability measures. This should be possible after the OECD inventory for 2022 is released.

SOE Investment (2013–2022)

This report uses the information made publicly available by majority government-owned SOEs focused on fossil-based energy through their annual reports from 2017 to 2022. Only national-level SOEs with a 50% or greater share of government ownership are included in this analysis. However, we recognize that some SOEs may have lower government ownership but still be directed by the state. For example, the Italian Ministry of Economy and Finance owns 30% of ENI (the Italian oil and gas company) with a golden share, meaning that the government has veto voting rights. ENI's second-largest shareholder is an Italian development bank whose largest shareholder is the Italian Ministry of Economy and Finance. However, we were unable to examine these details for all fossil fuel SOEs across G20 countries; therefore, we used the 50% ownership rule and note that the amount of SOE investment is most likely underestimated.

Where annual reports had not yet been published with 2022 data (6 of the 51 SOEs), we used the 2019–2021 average as an estimate for 2022. This is valid because historical data show that SOEs' capex does not fluctuate dramatically year-on-year.

Data were collected on renewable energy capex when readily available. Renewable energy capex was observed in SOEs in China, India, and France. However, the results are only indicative because not all companies publish disaggregated data on capital investments.

In China, not all energy SOEs' annual reports show how much they have invested in fossil and renewable technologies; some present only gross figures, which makes it impossible to determine from the outside if shifts have happened, for example, from fossil fuels to renewables or in reverse. Transparency is better for companies listed on a stock exchange because they must fulfill certain transparency requirements, including publishing annual reports that contain capex figures and descriptions of how their business is structured.

In our analysis, in several cases, financial data is given only for a Chinese listed subsidiary and not the whole group because the SOE as a whole is not as transparent as its listed subsidiary. Many of China's energy SOEs are conglomerates, and—given the strong economics of renewables—they tend to have some renewable investments mixed in, even if they started out as a company purely focused on fossil fuels. Without specific reporting to separate these investments, it is hard to determine their size and quantify or establish trends. Also, renewable and "new energy" companies are sometimes involved in the fossil fuel business, such as coalbed methane, and transition bonds have been spent on fossil fuels (e.g., "clean" natural gas). Such mixing of renewables and fossil fuels under creative terminologies makes it difficult to draw a clear line and identify precisely how much a company is investing in fossil fuels and renewables.

Fossil Fuel Public Finance, 2013-2022

This report uses the information made publicly available by majority government-owned financial institutions. These data can be found in Oil Change International's Public Finance for Energy Database (n.d.). Data on all global international public finance for 2022 was not available at the time of writing (expected in 2024). Data for the G7 and MDBs, however, was

available from 2013–2022, so this was used as an indication of public finance trends over the period.

The Public Finance for Energy Database (n.d.) collects all data on any institution that lends internationally. Some domestic development financial institutions lend internationally as well as domestically. In these cases, the database includes some domestic lending as international lending. This means that most domestic public finance is likely not included, and estimates are therefore highly conservative in nature.

The international public finance categories include the following technologies and fuel types:

- clean: solar, wind, wave, biomass, geothermal, batteries, green hydrogen, small hydro, fuel cells+hydrogen, energy efficiency, and related grid.
- fossil fuels: coal, oil, and gas, including these same fossil fuels for power generation.

Externalities

We use the IMF (Black et al., 2023) implicit subsidies as the global estimate of fossil fuel externalities. The externalities estimated by the IMF include the failure to fully charge for environmental damages, such as from air pollution and climate change, traffic-related costs (including accidents, congestion, and road damage), as well as exempting fuels and electricity from general consumption taxes.

We do not classify these as subsidies. The World Trade Organization definition of subsidies we have used does not include externalities arising from the use of fossil fuels. Some argue (including the IMF) that quantifying and presenting these costs provides a more accurate picture of the total cost to governments—or the revenue foregone—due to the use of fossil fuels. While we do not classify these costs as subsidies, we agree that taxes should be increased to reflect at least some external costs.

The inclusion of traffic externalities is controversial. Some argue that these costs also occur for electric vehicles. Others argue that, in the absence of a road user charge or specific congestion charge, fuel use is the next-best option for internalizing these costs for producers and consumers. Fuel prices are closely correlated with road accidents, road damage, and vehicle congestion (Burke & Nishitateno, 2015) (Zhang & Burke, 2020).

Renewable Energy Subsidies (2020–2023)

There are no up-to-date databases on global renewable energy subsidy expenditures. The most recent global estimate of renewable energy subsidies was published in 2020 by IRENA using 2017 data. Subsidies to renewable power generation technologies were estimated to be USD 128 billion in 2017, with the majority (91%) arising from the five largest subsidizing economies (China, the European Union, India, Japan, and the United States) and 9% from the rest of the world (IRENA, 2020).

Estimating global annual spending on renewable energy subsidies was beyond the scope of this project; instead, we estimated government spending commitments using data from the IEA (2023b) Government Energy Spending Tracker (data available to June 2023, contains data for 41 countries).

For G20 countries, we also added any additional measures from the Energy Policy Tracker (n.d.) (data available to December 2021) and Internet searches to find additional policies not captured by the Government Energy Spending Tracker. This was only done for G20 countries due to resource constraints.

The data covers renewable energy power generation (i.e., solar, wind, tidal, small hydro, and geothermal) and commitments to upgrade and expand the electricity grid with the goal of boosting the integration of renewable energy sources.

These announcements relate to funding committed over the Q2 2020 to Q2 2023 period, and that will be spent over future years (different time periods for each policy). As such, they are not directly comparable to the data on fossil fuel subsidies, SOE capex, or international public finance, which are annual data and relate to actual expenditures (for subsidies and SOE capex) or financing for projects that have closed in the given year. More transparency is needed on actual subsidy expenditures for renewable energy.

Fossil Fuel and Renewable Energy Investment Data

Data were provided by the Climate Policy Initiative and IRENA from their *Global Landscape* of *Renewable Energy Finance 2023* (2023). These data represent "primary" financial transactions going into both large- and small-scale projects that directly contribute to the deployment of renewable energy. They therefore exclude secondary transactions—for example, refinancing of existing debts or public trading in financial markets—as these do not represent new investments targeting new renewable energy assets but rather capital being exchanged for existing assets. Moreover, investments are recorded at the time of a project reaching financial close.

Overarching Data Assumptions

Nominal to real USD: All the USD values were adjusted for inflation and set to real 2022 USD based on the U.S. GDP price deflator, sourced from the World Bank (2013 to 2021) and Economic Research (2022).

Exchange rates: OECD's average annual exchange rates (indicator), obtained in April 2023, were used to convert local currencies to USD.

National and subnational coverage: It is difficult to gather information on subnational support, which means it is likely that some subnational measures have been overlooked. Where possible, the data include measures provided at the national and subnational levels. The OECD inventory of direct budget transfers and tax expenditures (OECD, n.d.), which feeds into the FFST, covers some subnational-level measures. For example, OECD (n.d.) subnational data coverage for the United States only include selected key producer and consumer states (OECD, n.d.). There are also SOEs that exist at the subnational level, including those established by municipal, state, and provincial governments. Investment by

these SOEs would have an impact on the level of overall support provided within a G20 country. However, due to the challenges of data access, they are not included in the estimates of SOE investment.

Data Gaps

Transparency of information on all types of government support for fossil fuels and renewables remains limited. Overall, our analysis of reporting demonstrates the significant gap globally in terms of their reporting on government support.

The study collects data only on national-level subsidy and SOE policies due to the huge resource effort needed to extend data collection to subnational bodies. Subnational jurisdictions can provide large subsidies and include large SOEs. In addition, the data does not capture a global estimate of SOE investments in fossil fuels. Therefore, it is likely that our findings underestimate the level of government support for fossil fuels across all support measures.

For some of the SOEs included in the analysis, no available data could be found for their capital investment for the entire period considered (e.g., for Argentina's YCRT and Energia Argentina); for others, data were missing for specific years in the period considered. This contributes to a further underestimation of governments' SOE investments.

References and Further Reading³

- Beaton, C., Gerasimchuk, I., Laan, T., Vis-Dunbar, D., Wooders, P., & Lang, K. (2013). *A guidebook to fossil-fuel subsidy reform for policy-makers in Southeast Asia*. International Institute for Sustainable Development.

 https://www.iisd.org/publications/report/guidebook-fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-policy-makers-southeast-asia
- Beaton, C., & Lontoh, L. (2010). Lessons learned from Indonesia's attempts to reform fossil-fuel subsidies. International Institute for Sustainable Development.

 https://www.iisd.org/publications/report/lessons-learned-indonesias-attempts-reform-fossil-fuel-subsidies
- Black, S., Liu, A., Parry, I., & Vernon, N. (2023). *IMF fossil fuel subsidies data: 2023 update*. International Monetary
 Fund. https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/WP/Issues/2023/08/22/IMF-Fossil-Fuel-Subsidies-Data-2023-Update-537281
- BloombergNEF. (2023, January 26). *Global low-carbon energy technology investment surges past \$1 trillion for the first time*. https://about.bnef.com/blog/global-low-carbon-energy-technology-investment-surges-past-1-trillion-for-the-first-time/
- Boisseau-Bouvier, E., & Cameron, L. (2022, July 28). *Identifying inefficient fossil fuel subsidies in Canada*. International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/publications/brief/identifying-inefficient-fossil-fuel-subsidies-canada
- BNDES. (n.d.). Central de downloads.

https://www.bndes.gov.br/wps/portal/site/home/transparencia/centraldedownloads/ !ut/p/z1/pVNNc5swEPoruXCUtY7Aht5w4vgLTzr1OA5cMgKEUQckIskmyavTHJIncZxJ9xYvd19u-

8tTvA9TgTd8y01XApa2f84GTxEwWI8dW8hgtWIQHg9nHnRJAB3TvCmA8AnXwg4e Z8 -QV9CL3FTXh3vSA-

 $\frac{AL7DCU4yYRpT4jgVOdMPXGjDzS7rGDhQypo5YBQVuqGKiYxTBzImbKS6yNlFLltRS}{ZrrQ6Um4zmOA8YIAxgioD4g1ysC5GdpgMgQCt8bpCzN8zfmJoZLTg82PznaenDYHf9-JiEdkApDHsy-P78CZk2VgSLy6hGsmGKdnCuka3A6lRWWuovSNj9fo-$

ETdG7ylBUcEEPodruXep3D8dPiDo1UhmaUXnofamWV8ut1YWaEnFR2OBZqZuDm H_JQ37eQDiN-

 $\frac{mt_3OYLLhXsMuJ2RsQVcRZ_47XvQnAXkDnFAwtg_4YfuqAUR9v9py1eC2kquotrP7TYN}{MPHvnosW} K868rsD23lUxfjzcUKfHt hUrmGKqt1M2XBrT6B8OONC2ba9r19vKfS9\\ VNtJYdTsZbFPNDfvKGa WlEyjrtD51jimVkpthz9mhJt6XfvkGSWpV-2jYjVD8XzfPpOXiG3-AMIN4 o!/dz/d5/L2dBISEvZoFBIS9nQSEh/$

Bois von Kursk, O., Muttit, G., Picciariello, A., & Dufour, L. (2022, October 21). *Navigating energy transitions: Mapping the road to 1.5°C.* International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/publications/report/navigating-energy-transitions

-

³ This reference list includes sources cited in both the methodology and the digital story.

- Burke, P. J., & Nishitateno, S. (2015). Gasoline prices and road fatalities: International evidence. *Economic Inquiry*, *53*(3), 1437–1450. https://doi.org/10.1111/ecin.12171
- Cameron, L., Carter, A., & Stievert, K., (2023, September 7). Why the cost of carbon capture and storage remains persistently high. International Institute for Sustainable Development. high#:~:text=The%20pursuit%20of%20CCS%20in,risky%20use%20of%20public%20funds.
- Carter, A., & Cameron, L. (2023, February 9). Why carbon capture and storage is not a netzero solution for Canada's oil and gas sector. International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/articles/deep-dive/carbon-capture-not-net-zero-solution
- Clark, A. & Benoit, P. (2022, February 3). *Greenhouse gas emissions from state-owned enterprises: A preliminary inventory*. Center on Global Energy Policy, Columbia. https://www.energypolicy.columbia.edu/publications/greenhouse-gas-emissions-state-owned-enterprises-preliminary-inventory/
- Climate Policy Initiative. (2014). *Moving to a low-carbon economy: The impact of policy pathways on fossil fuel asset values*. https://climatepolicyinitiative.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/10/Moving-to-a-Low-Carbon-Economy-The-Impacts-of-Policy-Pathways-on-Fossil-Fuel-Asset-Values.pdf
- Climate Policy Initiative & International Renewable Energy Agency. (2023, February). Global landscape of renewable energy finance 2023. https://www.irena.org/Publications/2023/Feb/Global-landscape-of-renewable-energy-finance-2023
- Coady, D., Flamini, V., & Sears, L. (2015, November 15). *The unequal benefits of fuel subsidies revisited: Evidence for developing countries* (WP 15/250). International Monetary Fund. https://doi.org/10.5089/9781513501390.001
- Coady, D., Parry, I., Le, N. -P., & Shang, B. (2019). Global fossil fuel subsidies remain large:

 An update based on country-level estimates (WP/19/89). International Monetary
 Fund.

 https://www.imf.org/~/media/Files/Publications/WP/2019/WPIEA2019089.ashx
- COP28, International Renewable Energy Agency, & Global Renewables Alliance. (2023). Tripling renewable power and doubling energy efficiency by 2030: Crucial steps towards 1.5°C. International Renewable Energy Agency. https://www.irena.org/Publications/2023/Oct/Tripling-renewable-power-and-doubling-energy-efficiency-by-2030
- Corkal, V. (2021, February 21). *Federal fossil fuel subsidies in Canada: COVID-19 edition*. International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/publications/fossil-fuel-subsidies-canada-covid-19
- Department for Work & Pensions. (2022, July 28). *Household Support Fund management information for 6 October 2021 to 31 March 2022*. UK Government. https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/household-support-fund-management-

- information-6-october-2021-to-31-march-2022/household-support-fund-management-information-for-6-october-2021-to-31-march-2022
- E3G & Oil Change International. (2023). *Briefing: G7 countries can shift billions into clean energy if they strengthen their commitment to end international fossil finance*. https://priceofoil.org/content/uploads/2023/04/G7-Public-Finance-Briefing OCI April2023.pdf
- Economic Research. (2022). FRED economic data: GDP implicit price deflator in United States. Federal Reserve Bank of St Louis. https://fred.stlouisfed.org/series/USAGDPDEFAISMEI
- Ellerbeck, S. (2023, February 17). What's the difference between 'friendshoring' and other global trade buzzwords? World Economic Forum.

 https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2023/02/friendshoring-global-trade-buzzwords/
- Empresa de Pesquisa Energética. (2022). *Blanço Energetico Nacional 2022*. https://www.epe.gov.br/pt/publicacoes-dados-abertos/publicacoes/balanco-energetico-nacional-2022
- Empresa de Pesquisa Energética & Minsterio de Minas e Energia. (2011). *Anuário estatístico de energia elétrica 2011*. https://www.epe.gov.br/sites-pt/publicacoes-dados-abertos/publicacoes/PublicacoesArquivos/publicacao-160/topico-168/Anu%C3%A1rio%20Estat%C3%ADstico%20de%20Energia%20El%C3%A9trica%202011.pdf
- Empresa de Pesquisa Energética & Minsterio de Minas e Energia. (2021). *Anuário estatístico de energia elétrica 2021 ano base 2020*. https://www.epe.gov.br/sites-pt/publicacoes-dados-abertos/publicacoes/PublicacoesArquivos/publicacao-160/topico-168/Anu%C3%A1rio_2021.pdf
- Energy.gov. (n.d.). *Inflation Reduction Act of 2022*. https://www.energy.gov/lpo/inflation-reduction-act-2022
- Energy Transitions Commission. (2023). *Material and resource requirements for the energy transition: Executive summary*. https://www.energy-transitions.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/08/ETC-Materials-ExecSummary_highres-1.pdf
- Energy Policy Tracker. (n.d.). *G20 countries*. International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.energypolicytracker.org/region/g20/
- Erikson, P., van Asselt, H., Koplow, D., Lazarus, M., Newell, P., Oreskes, N., & Supran, G. (2020, February 5). Why fossil fuel producer subsidies matter. *Nature*, *578*, E1-E4. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-019-1920-x
- European Commission. (2023). Report from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council on the review of emergency interventions to address high energy prices in accordance with Council Regulation (EU) 2022/1854 (COM(2023) 302 final). https://energy.ec.europa.eu/system/files/2023-06/COM-2023-302-1-EN-ACT-part1-v2.pdf

- Federal Government of Germany. (2022). *Germany stands united at this challenging time*. https://www.bundesregierung.de/breg-en/news/third-relief-package-2123130
- FossilFuelSubsidyTracker.org. (n.d.-a). Fossil fuel subsidy tracker. International Institute for Sustainable Development & Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. https://fossilfuelsubsidytracker.org/
- FossilFuelSubsidyTracker.org. (n.d.-b). *Methodology*. International Institute for Sustainable Development & Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. https://fossilfuelsubsidytracker.org/methodology/
- French, G. (2022). Los subsidies a los combustibles fósiles 2021-2022/ Desafinando en tiempo y en compás. Fundación Ambiente y Recursos Naturales.

 https://farn.org.ar/wp-content/uploads/2022/12/DOC_SUBSIDIOS_20211-2022-final.pdf
- G7 Leaders. (2022, June 28). *G7 Leaders' communiqué*. <u>https://www.g7germany.de/resource/blob/974430/2062292/9c213e6b4b36ed1bd687e82480040399/2022-07-14-leaders-communique-data.pdf?download=1</u>
- G20 Leaders. (2009, September). *G20 Leaders statement: The Pittsburgh Summit.* http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2009/2009communique0925.html
- Garg, V., Viswanathan, B., Narayanaswamy, D., Beaton, C., Ganesan, K., Sharma, S., & Bridle, R. (2020, April 7). *Mapping India's energy subsidies 2020: Fossil fuels, renewables and electric vehicles*. International Institute for Sustainable Development, Global Subsidies Initiative, & Council on Energy, Environment and Water. https://www.iisd.org/publications/report/mapping-indias-energy-subsidies-2020-fossil-fuels-renewables-and-electric
- Geddes, A., Gerasimchuk, I., Viswanathan, B., Suharsono, A., Corkal, V., Roth, J., Picciariello, A., Tucker, B., Doukas, A., & Gençsü, I. (2020a, November 9). *Doubling back and doubling down: G20 scorecard on fossil fuel funding.* International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/publications/g20-scorecard
- Geddes, A., Gerasimchuk, I., Viswanathan, B., Suharsono, A., Corkal, V., Roth, J., Picciariello, A., Tucker, B., Doukas, A., & Gençsü, I. (2020b, November 9). *Doubling back and doubling down: G20 scorecard on fossil fuel funding Methodology Note.* International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/system/files/2020-11/g20-scorecard-methodology.pdf
- Government of Canada. (2023). *Inefficient fossil fuel subsidies: Government of Canada guidelines*.

 https://www.canada.ca/en/services/environment/weather/climatechange/climate-plan/inefficient-fossil-fuel-subsidies/guidelines.html
- Grattan, M. (2021, April 20). *Hydrogen and carbon capture receive extra funding, as Morrison prepares for Biden summit.* The Conversation.

 https://theconversation.com/hydrogen-and-carbon-capture-receive-extra-funding-as-morrison-prepares-for-biden-summit-159361

- Institute of Socioeconomic Studies. (2022, November). Fossil Fuel Subsidies: Know, Assess and Reform. INESC. https://www.inesc.org.br/wp-content/uploads/2022/11/INGLES_ESTUDO-COMBUSTIVEIS.pdf
- International Energy Agency. (n.d.-a). *Energy subsidies: Tracking the impact of fossil-fuel subsidies*. https://www.iea.org/topics/energy-subsidies
- International Energy Agency. (n.d.-b). *Fossil fuel subsidies database*. https://www.iea.org/data-and-statistics/data-product/fossil-fuel-subsidies-database#subsidies-database
- International Energy Agency. (n.d.-c). *Hydrogen*. https://www.iea.org/energy-system/low-emission-fuels/hydrogen
- International Energy Agency. (n.d.-c). *The price-gap approach*. https://www.iea.org/topics/energy-subsidies#methodology-and-assumptions
- International Energy Agency. (2020). *Brazil: Country profile*. https://www.iea.org/countries/brazil
- International Energy Agency. (2021, May 18). *Pathway to critical and formidable goal of net-zero emissions by 2050 is narrow but brings huge benefits, according to IEA special report* [Press release]. https://www.iea.org/news/pathway-to-critical-and-formidable-goal-of-net-zero-emissions-by-2050-is-narrow-but-brings-huge-benefits
- International Energy Agency. (2022a, November 16). *Australian Clean Hydrogen Trade Program (ACHTP)*. https://www.iea.org/policies/14738-australian-clean-hydrogen-trade-program-achtp
- International Energy Agency. (2022b, December 2). *Budget October 2022-23: Energy and emissions reduction*. https://www.iea.org/policies/14928-budget-october-202223-energy-and-emissions-reduction
- International Energy Agency. (2022c, August 18). *Energy statistics data browser*. https://www.iea.org/data-and-statistics/data-tools/energy-statistics-data-browser?country=WORLD&fuel=Energy%20supply&indicator=TESbySource
- International Energy Agency. (2023a). *Coal 2022*. https://www.iea.org/reports/coal-2022/executive-summary
- International Energy Agency. (2023b). *Energy technology perspectives 2023*. https://www.iea.org/reports/energy-technology-perspectives-2023
- International Energy Agency. (2023c). *Fossil fuel subsidies database*. https://www.iea.org/data-and-statistics/data-product/fossil-fuel-subsidies-database
- International Energy Agency. (2023d). *Fossil fuels consumption studies 2022*. https://www.iea.org/reports/fossil-fuels-consumption-subsidies-2022

- International Energy Agency. (2023e). *Government energy spending tracker*. https://www.iea.org/reports/government-energy-spending-tracker-2
- International Energy Agency. (2023f). *Net zero roadmap: A global pathway to keep the* 1.5°C goal in reach. https://www.iea.org/reports/net-zero-roadmap-a-global-pathway-to-keep-the-15-oc-goal-in-reach/executive-summary
- International Energy Agency. (2023g). *Scaling up private finance for clean energy in emerging and developing economies: Key findings.*https://www.iea.org/reports/scaling-up-private-finance-for-clean-energy-in-emerging-and-developing-economies/key-findings#abstract
- International Energy Agency. (2023h). *The role of critical minerals in clean energy transitions*. https://www.iea.org/reports/the-role-of-critical-minerals-in-clean-energy-transitions/sustainable-and-responsible-development-of-minerals
- International Energy Agency. (2023i). *World energy investment 2023*. https://iea.blob.core.windows.net/assets/8834d3af-af60-4dfo-9643-72e2684f7221/WorldEnergyInvestment2023.pdf
- International Energy Agency. (2023j). *World energy investment 2023: Overview and key findings*. https://www.iea.org/reports/world-energy-investment-2023/overview-and-key-findings
- International Energy Agency, International Monetary Fund, Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, & Global Subsidies Initiative/International Institute for Sustainable Development. (n.d.). *Comparison of fossil-fuel subsidy and support estimates*.
 - https://www.iisd.org/gsi/sites/default/files/ffs_methods_estimationcomparison.pdf
- International Institute for Sustainable Development. (2022a). Report: Countries could shift almost USD 28 billion/year from fossil fuels to jump-start the energy transition—if they follow through on their pledges [Press release].

 $\underline{https://www.iisd.org/articles/press-release/glasgow-statement-could-shift-annual-28-billion-to-}\\$

clean#:~:text=The%20Glasgow%20Statement%20was%20signed,%2C%20El%20Salvador%2C%20Ethiopia%2C%20the

- International Institute for Sustainable Development. (2022b). *Planned new oil and gas investments incompatible with 1.5°C warming limit, could fully finance wind and solar scale-up to curb climate change* [Press release].

 https://www.iisd.org/articles/press-release/planned-new-oil-and-gas-investments-incompatible-15degc-warming-limit-could
- International Institute for Sustainable Development & Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development. (2023). *Fossil fuel subsidies tracker*. https://fossilfuelsubsidytracker.org/
- International Monetary Fund. (2022). Climate change: Fossil fuel subsidies. https://www.imf.org/en/Topics/climate-change/energy-subsidies#A%20Global%20Picture%20of%20Energy%20Subsidies

- International Monetary Fund. (2023a). *GDP based on PPP, share of world* [Map]. https://www.imf.org/external/datamapper/PPPSH@WEO/EU/CHN/USA
- International Monetary Fund. (2023b). *IMF fossil fuel subsidies data: 2023 update*. <a href="https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/WP/Issues/2023/08/22/IMF-Fossil-Fuel-Subsidies-Data-2023-Update-537281#:~:text=Globally%2C%20fossil%20fuel%20subsidies%20were,warming%20and%20local%20air%20pollution
- International Renewable Energy Agency. (2020, April). *Energy subsidies: Evolution in the global energy transformation to 2050*. https://www.irena.org/publications/2020/Apr/Energy-Subsidies-2020
- International Renewable Energy Agency. (2023a). Geopolitics of the energy transition:

 Critical materials. <a href="https://mc-cd8320d4-36a1-40ac-83cc-3389-cdn-endpoint.azureedge.net/-/media/Files/IRENA/Agency/Publication/2023/Jul/IRENA Geopolitics energy transition critical materials 2023.pdf?rev=420aeb58d2e745d79f1b564ea89ef9f8
- International Renewable Energy Agency. (2023b). World energy transitions outlook 2023:

 1.5°C pathway, Volume 1. https://mc-cd8320d4-36a1-40ac-83cc-3389-cdn-endpoint.azureedge.net//media/Files/IRENA/Agency/Publication/2023/Jun/IRENA World energy transitions outlook v1 2023.pdf?rev=cc4522ff897a4e26a47906447c74bca6
- International Renewable Energy Agency. (2022). World energy transitions outlook 2022: 1.5°C pathway. https://www.irena.org/-/media/Files/IRENA/Agency/Publication/2022/Mar/IRENA World Energy Transit ions Outlook 2022.pdf?rev=6ff451981b0948c6894546661c6658a1
- Klaiber, C., Rentschler, J., & Dorband, I. (2023, April). *Distributional and health co-benefits of fossil fuel subsidy reforms: Evidence from 35 countries* (Policy research working paper 10398). World Bank Group.

 https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/server/api/core/bitstreams/a6ca75d6-985e-4d7c-9768-3f90ea9c1eb0/content
- Laan, T., Geddes, A., Jones, N., Bois von Kursk, O., Jones, N., Kuehne, K., Gerbase, L., O'Manique, C., Sharma, D., & Stockman, L. (2023). Fanning the Flames: G20 provides record financial support for fossil fuels. International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/publications/report/fanning-flames-g20-support-of-fossil-fuels
- Laan, T. & Giulio Maino, A. (2022, July 7). Boom and bust: The fiscal implications of fossil fuel phase-out in six large emerging economies. International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/publications/report/fossil-fuel-phase-out-briics-economies
- Li, M., Trencher, G., & Asuka, J. (2022, February 16). The clean energy claims of BP, Chevron, ExxonMobil and Shell: A mismatch between discourse, actions, and investments. *PlosOne*, 17(2): e0263596. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0263596

- Legambiente. (n.d.). *Stop sissidi alle fonti fossili* (in Italian).

 https://www.legambiente.it/rapporti-e-osservatori/stop-sussidi-ambientalmente-dannosi/
- Manley, D., & Haller, P. R. P. (2021, February). *Risky bet: National oil companies in the energy transition*. Natural Resource Governance Institute.

 https://resourcegovernance.org/sites/default/files/documents/risky-bet-national-oil-companies-in-the-energy-transition.pdf
- McKinsey & Company. (2022, October 24). *The Inflation Reduction Act: Here's what's in it.*https://www.mckinsey.com/industries/public-sector/our-insights/the-inflation-reduction-act-heres-whats-in-it
- Ministry of Power. (2022, July 22). NTPC inks Statement of Intent with NITI Aayog to develop net zero GHG emissions roadmap for NTPC.

 https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseIframePage.aspx?PRID=1843454
- Muttitt, G., Sharma, S., Mostafa, M., Kühne, K., DOukas, A., Gerasimchuk, I., & Roith, J. (2021, June 6). *Step off the gas: International public finance, natural gas, and clean alternatives in the Global South*. https://www.iisd.org/publications/natural-gas-finance-clean-alternatives-global-south
- Natural Resource Governance Institute. (2022). *State-owned enterprises*. https://resourcegovernance.org/topics/state-owned-enterprises
- Nicole. (2023, September 6). Fossil finance violations: Tracking fossil fuel projects that violate commitments to end international public finance for fossil fuels. Oil Change International. https://priceofoil.org/2023/09/06/fossil-finance-violations-tracking-fossil-fuels/
- NTPC. (n.d.). Installed capacity. https://www.ntpc.co.in/installed-capacity
- NTPC. (2022). 46th integrated annual report 2021–2022. https://www.ntpc.co.in/sites/default/files/annual-report/complete-reports/Annual-Report-2021-22.pdf
- NTPC. (2023, May 19). *NTPC limited Q4 FY23 earnings conference call*. https://www.ntpc.co.in/sites/default/files/inline-files/TranscriptNTPCQ4FY23.pdf
- Oil Change International. (n.d.). *Public finance for energy database*. https://energyfinance.org/#/
- Oil Change International. (2023, Match 15). Promise breakers: Assessing the impact of compliance with the Glasgow statement commitment to end international public finance for fossil fuels. https://priceofoil.org/2023/03/15/promise-breakers-assessing-the-impact-of-compliance-with-the-glasgow-statement-commitment-to-end-international-public-finance-for-fossil-fuels/
- OCI Team. (2022, October 7). Leaders & laggards: Tracking implementation of the COP26 commitment to end international public finance for fossil fuels. https://priceofoil.org/2022/10/07/leaders-laggards/

- OCI Team. (2023, March 15). Promise breakers: Assessing the impact of compliance with the Glasgow Statement commitment to end international public finance for fossil fuels. https://priceofoil.org/2023/03/15/promise-breakers-assessing-the-impact-of-compliance-with-the-glasgow-statement-commitment-to-end-international-public-finance-for-fossil-fuels/
- Oil Change International & Friends of the Earth United States. (2022). *At a crossroads:*Assessing G20 and MDB international energy finance ahead of Stop Funding Fossils pledge deadline. https://priceofoil.org/content/uploads/2022/11/G20-At-A-Crossroads.pdf
- O'Manique, C. (2023, April 4). *Explainer: Latest data shows the World Bank Group and its peers are still locking in a fossil future*. Oil Change International. https://priceofoil.org/2023/04/04/explainer-latest-data-shows-the-world-bank-group-and-its-peers-are-still-locking-in-a-fossil-future/
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. (n.d.-a). *Climate finance and the USD 100 billion goal*. https://www.oecd.org/climate-change/finance-usd-100-billion-goal/
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. (n.d.-b). *OECD work on support for fossil fuels*. https://www.oecd.org/fossil-fuels/
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. (2021, October 27). *Carbon pricing in times of COVID-19: What has changed in G20 economics*. https://www.oecd.org/tax/tax-policy/carbon-pricing-in-times-of-covid-19-what-has-changed-in-g20-economies.htm
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. (2022a). *Global outlook on financing for sustainable development 2023: Executive summary*. <a href="https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/sites/fcbe6ce9-en/index.html?itemId=/content/publication/fcbe6ce9-en/index
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. (2022b). *Pricing greenhouse gas emissions: Turning climate targets into climate action*.

 https://www.oecd.org/tax/tax-policy/pricing-greenhouse-gas-emissions-turning-climate-targets-into-climate-action.htm
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. (2023). *OECD inventory of support measures for fossil fuels: Country notes*. https://www.oecd.org/env/oecd-companion-to-the-inventory-of-support-measures-for-fossil-fuels-country-notes-5a3efe65-en.htm
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development & International Energy Agency. (2021). *Update on recent progress in reform of inefficient fossil-fuel subsidies that encourage wasteful consumption*. <u>Update-2021.pdf</u>
- Overhyping hydrogen as a fuel risk endangering net-zero goals [Editorial]. (2022, November 16). *Nature*, *611*, 426. https://doi.org/10.1038/d41586-022-03693-6

- Parry, I. W. H., Black, S., & Roaf, J. (2021). Proposal for an international carbon price floor among large emitters. International Energy Agency.

 https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/staff-climate-notes/Issues/2021/06/15/Proposal-for-an-International-Carbon-Price-Floor-Among-Large-Emitters-460468
- Parry, I. W. H., Black, S., & Vernon, N. (2021, September 24). *Still not getting energy prices right: A global and country update of fossil fuel subsidies* (WP 2021/236). https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/WP/Issues/2021/09/23/Still-Not-Getting-Energy-Prices-Right-A-Global-and-Country-Update-of-Fossil-Fuel-Subsidies-466004
- Petroleum Planning & Analysis Cell. (n.d.). *Statement showing the actual rates of state taxes/GST*. https://ppac.gov.in/prices/vat-sales-tax-gst-rates
- Poupard, A., Fetet, M., & Postic, S. (2022, September 21). *Global carbon accounts in 2022*. https://www.i4ce.org/en/publication/global-carbon-acounts-2022-climate/
- Prasad, A., Loukoianova, E., Feng, A. X., & Oman, W. (2022, July 27). Mobilizing private climate financing in emerging market and developing economies. *Staff Climate Notes* (*IMF*), 7. https://doi.org/10.5089/9798400216428.066
- Public Finance for Energy Database. (n.d.). *Home page*. https://energyfinance.org/#/
- Raheja, S. (2023, October 6). Climate finance beyond \$100 billion: Are we close to agreeing on a new climate finance target? DowntoEarth.

 https://www.downtoearth.org.in/blog/governance/climate-finance-beyond-100-billion-are-we-close-to-agreeing-on-a-new-climate-finance-target--92163
- Raizada, S., Laan, T., Manish, M., & Viswanathan, B. (2022, December). *Mapping India's energy policy 2022 (update)*. International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/story/mapping-india-energy-policy-2022-update
- REN21. (2022). Renewables 2022: Global status report. https://www.ren21.net/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/GSR2022 Full Report.pdf
- Reuters. (2022, October 15). *India raises windfall tax on crude oil output*. https://www.reuters.com/world/india/india-raises-windfall-tax-crude-oil-output-2022-10-15/
- Ritchie, H., (2023, January 18). *Mining quantities for low-carbon energy is hundreds to thousands of times lower than mining for fossil fuels*. Sustainability by Numbers. https://www.sustainabilitybynumbers.com/p/mining-low-carbon-vs-fossil
- Rowell, A. (2021, June 17). *Carbon capture: Five decades of false hope, hype, and hot air.*Oil Change International. https://priceofoil.org/2021/06/17/carbon-capture-five-decades-of-industry-false-hope-hype-and-hot-air/
- Rowell, A. (2022, January 22). *US government wastes \$1 billion on "failed" CCS projects*. Oil Change International. https://priceofoil.org/2022/01/13/us-government-wastes-1-billion-on-failed-ccs-projects/

- Sanchez, L., Wooders, P., Mostafa, M., & Bechauf, R. (2020, August 19). *54 ways to reform fossil fuel consumer subsidies and pricing*. Global Subsidies Initiative/International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/gsi/subsidy-watch-blog/53-ways-reform-fossil-fuel-consumer-subsidies-and-pricing
- Sgaravetti, G., Tagliapietra, S., Trasi, C., & Zachman, G. (2023, June 26). *National fiscal policy responses to the energy crisis*. Bruegel. https://www.bruegel.org/dataset/national-policies-shield-consumers-rising-energy-prices
- Stern, N., & Stiglitz, J. E. (2021, February 15). *Getting the social cost of carbon right*. https://www.project-syndicate.org/commentary/biden-administration-climate-change-higher-carbon-price-by-nicholas-stern-and-joseph-e-stiglitz-2021-02
- Sustainable Development Goals. (n.d.). https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/
- Ukoh, J. (2023, March 27). The cost of Zambia's educational system. *African Leadership Magazine*. https://www.africanleadershipmagazine.co.uk/the-cost-of-zambias-educational-system/
- The Big Shift Global. (2022, November 9). World Bank Group and other major MDBs' joint update on Paris alignment at COP27 lacks ambitions on climate targets. https://bigshiftglobal.org/MDBs COP27 PA Update
- The Big Shift Global. (2023, October 26). *Big Shift Global letter to Pres. Banga re fossil fuel finance*. https://bigshiftglobal.org/Banga Letter Oct23
- United Nations. (n.d.). Causes and effects of climate change.

 https://www.un.org/en/climatechange/science/causes-effects-climate-change#:~:text=Fossil%20fuels%20%E2%80%93%20coal%2C%20oil%20and,of%20all%20carbon%20dioxide%20emissions.
- United Nations. (2015). *Paris Agreement*. https://unfccc.int/sites/default/files/english paris agreement.pdf
- United Nations Climate Change. (n.d.). *Paris Agreement Status of ratification*. https://unfccc.int/process/the-paris-agreement/status-of-ratification
- United Nations Climate Change. (2021). *Glasgow Climate Pact*. https://unfccc.int/documents/310475
- United Nations Climate Change. (2023a). *New collective quantified goal on climate finance*. https://unfccc.int/NCQG
- United Nations Climate Change. (2023b, June 5). *Work on new collective quantified goal for climate finances reaches halfway mark*. https://unfccc.int/news/work-on-new-collective-quantified-goal-for-climate-finance-reaches-halfway-mark
- UN Climate Change Conference UK 2021. (2021). Statement on international public support for the clean energy transition.

 https://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/ukgwa/20230313124743/https:/ukcop26.org/statement-on-international-public-support-for-the-clean-energy-transition/

- United Nations Conference on Trade and Development. (2023, September 18). *UNCTAD* counts the costs of achieving sustainable development.

 https://unctad.org/news/unctad-counts-costs-achieving-sustainable-development-goals
- United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change. (2023, October). *Synthesis Report: Views on the elements for the consideration of outputs component of the first global stocktake*. https://unfccc.int/documents/632292
- UN World Food Program USA. (2022, August 10). *How much would it cost to end world hunger?* https://www.wfpusa.org/articles/how-much-would-it-cost-to-end-world-hunger/
- Viswanathan, B., Raizada, S., Bassi, A., Pallaske, G., & Beaton, C. (2002, September 21). *India's state-owned energy enterprises, 2020–2050.* International Institute for Sustainable Development. https://www.iisd.org/publications/report/india-state-owned-energy-enterprises
- World Bank. (n.d.). *Population*, total. https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SP.POP.TOTL
- World Trade Organization. (1995). *Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures*. https://www.wto.org/english/docs_e/legal_e/24-scm.pdf
- World Bank. (2023a). *Carbon pricing dashboard*. https://carbonpricingdashboard.worldbank.org/map_data
- World Bank. (2023b). *GDP deflator (base year varies by country)*. https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GDP.DEFL.ZS
- World Bank. (2023c). *GDP per capita current*. https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GDP.PCAP.CD
- World Bank. (2023d). Pollution. https://www.worldbank.org/en/topic/pollution
- Zhang, T., & Burke, P. J. (2020). The effect of fuel prices on traffic flows: Evidence from New South Wales. *Transportation Research Part A: Policy and Practice*, 141, 502–522. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tra.2020.09.025

Appendix 1. List of Public Finance Institutions Reviewed

G7 Country/ MDBs	Institution
Canada	Export Development Canada, Sustainable Development Technology Canada
France	Proparco
Germany	Euler Hermes, KfW IPEX-Bank, German Investment & Development Corporation, German Investment & Development Corporation, Kreditanstalt fur Wiederaufbau
Italy	Servizi Assicurativi del Commercio Estero
Japan	Japan Bank for International Co-operation, Nippon Export and Investment Insurance, Japan Oil Gas and Metals National Corporation, Japan International Cooperation Agency, Japan Oil Gas and Metals National Corporation, Development Bank of Japan, Japan International Cooperation Agency
United Kingdom	UK Export Finance, CDC Group Plc
United States	Export-Import Bank of the United States, Overseas Private Investment Corporation
MDBs	African Development Bank, Asian Development Bank, Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank, European Bank for Reconstruction and Development, European Investment Bank, Inter-American Development Bank, Islamic Development Bank, New Development Bank, North American Development Bank, World Bank Group (International Bank for Reconstruction and Development, International Development Association, International Finance Corporation, Multilateral Investment Guarantee Agency)

Appendix 2. List of Majority State-Owned Enterprises Reviewed

G20 Country	SOE Name	
Argentina	YPF, Yacimientos Carboníferos Río Turbio, Energia Argentina (ENARSA/ IEASA), Pampa Energy	
Australia	(No national-level energy state-owned enterprises [SOEs])	
Brazil	Petrobras	
Canada	Trans Mountain Pipeline	
China	Sinopec Group (China Petrochemical Corporation), Petro China (CNPC), CNOOC, China Huadian Corporation, China Coal Energy, China Huaneng Group Corporation, China Datang Corporation, China Energy Investment Corp, China Guodian Corporation, Shenhua Group, Dongfang Electric Corporation, State Development & Investment Corporation, Sinochem Group, State Power Investment Corporation, China Resources Power Holding	
France	EDF	
Germany	(No national-level energy SOEs)	
India	ONGC, GAIL, IOCL, BPCL, HPCL, CIL, SCCL, NTPC, BHEL	
Indonesia	Pertamina, PTBA, PLN, PGN	
Italy	(No national-level energy SOEs)	
Japan	(No national-level energy SOEs)	
Mexico	Pemex, Comisión Federal de Electricidad (CFE)	
Russia	Gazprom, Rosneft, Bashneft	
Saudi Arabia	Saudi Aramco, Saudi Electricity Company	
South Africa	Petro SA, Transnet, Eskom, AEMFC	

G20 Country	SOE Name
Korea	KNOC
Korea	KEPCO, KOGAS, KOCOAL
Turkey	TKI, TTK, EÜAŞ, BOTAŞ, TPAO
United Kingdom	(No national-level energy SOEs)
United States	(No national-level energy SOEs)

2023 The International Institute for Sustainable Development	
blished by the International Institute for Sustainable Development	
nis publication is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-N	on-Commercial-
nareAlike 4.0 International License.	